Biogeographical crossroad across the Pillars of Hercules: Evolutionary history of *Psammodromus* lizards in space and time

Joana Mendes | D. James Harris | Salvador Carranza | Daniele Salvi

1CIBIO Research Centre in Biodiversity and Genetic Resources, InBIO, Universidade do Porto, Rua Padre Armando Quintas, Vairão, Vila do Conde, Portugal
2Departamento de Biologia, Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade do Porto, Porto, Portugal
3Institute of Evolutionary Biology (CSIC-Universitat Pompeu Fabra), Barcelona, Spain
4Department of Health, Life and Environmental Sciences, University of L’Aquila, Coppito, L’Aquila, Italy

**Correspondence**
Daniele Salvi, Department of Health, Life and Environmental Sciences, University of L’Aquila, L’Aquila, Italy.
Email: danielesalvi.bio@gmail.com

**Funding information**
Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, Grant/Award Number: SFRH/BD/81528/2011; Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad, Grant/Award Number: CGL2015-70390

**Editor:** Aristeidis Parmakelis

**Abstract**

**Aim:** To infer the biogeographical and evolutionary history of the Western Mediterranean *Psammodromus* lizards with the aim of assessing the role of vicariance and dispersal on the cladogenetic events within the palaeogeological dynamics of the Strait of Gibraltar.

**Location:** North Africa and Western Europe.

**Methods:** We built a dataset including all six species of *Psammodromus* using mitochondrial (12S, cytb, nd4) and nuclear (acm4, mc1r, pomc) gene fragments. Species tree and concatenation methods were used to infer phylogenetic relationships and divergence times. Phylogenies were used for biogeographical inference using S-DIVA, DEC and BBM.

**Results:** *Psammodromus* probably originated in Iberia, with *P. algirus* diverging early. The ancestor of the African *P. blanci* and *P. microdactylus* dispersed to Africa through the Betic-Rif massif, c. 10 Ma. The cladogenetic events within Africa and Iberia were probably due to vicariance mediated by habitat and climatic changes at the end of the Miocene (*P. blanci* and *P. microdactylus*) and during the Pliocene (*P. occidentalis*, *P. hispanicus* and *P. edwardsianus*). *Psammodromus algirus* shows three lineages, two in Iberia and one in Africa, the latter originated following a transmarine dispersal during the Middle Pleistocene (1.5 Ma).

**Main conclusions:** Over-sea dispersal has played a major role in intercontinental exchange and divergence in *Psammodromus*, with two dispersal events towards Africa that occurred 10 and 1.5 Ma resulting in the African lineages. This study, combined with previous literature, provides compelling evidence that major biotic exchanges took place across the Strait of Gibraltar well before or long after the land connection during the Messinian Salinity Crisis (MSC, 5.9–5.33 Ma). These findings suggest caution in the application of the relatively short event of Atlantic flooding at the end of the MSC as cause for divergence in molecular clock calibrations, which is a popular approach in literature.

**Keywords**
dispersal, Iberian Peninsula, Lacertidae, Messinian Salinity Crisis, North Africa, phylogeography, species tree, Strait of Gibraltar, transmarine colonization, vicariance

DOI: 10.1111/jbi.13100
INTRODUCTION

Biotic exchange between continents through vicariance and dispersal has classically been the focus of many biogeographical studies. The main faunal exchanges of North Africa have been with the Arabian Peninsula and the Levant through the Sinai in the east and with south-western Europe across the Strait of Gibraltar in the west. While dispersal has played a major role in the stable land bridge at the eastern crossroad (e.g. Carranza, Arnold, Geniez, Roca, & Mateo, 2008; Metallinou et al., 2015; Tamar et al., 2016) the history of intermittent connections at the Strait of Gibraltar has created opportunities for both vicariance and dispersal to contribute to the biotic exchange between North Africa and Western Europe (e.g. Carranza et al., 2008; García-Vázquez et al., 2016; Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2010).

The Pillars of Hercules, as the Strait of Gibraltar has been known since ancient times, is an excellent setting for biogeographical inference, due to its well-known complex geological history (Figure 1). Briefly, in the middle Oligocene, the Hercynian belt detached from Iberia and broke into smaller blocks, including the Betic-Rif, which drifted southwards until reaching its final position in the Strait of Gibraltar, 10 Ma. Here, from the Middle Miocene, tectonic uplift caused progressive land emergence and reduction in seaways (Braga, Martin, & Quesada, 2003; Duggen, Hoernie, van den Bogaard, Rupke, & Morgan, 2003; Rosenbaum, Lister, & Duboz, 2002a), until the connection between the Mediterranean and the Atlantic was maintained by the Betic, Guadalhorce and the Rif corridors. The Betic corridor closed approximately 10 Ma and re-opened 8–9 Ma. As the sea level gradually decreased, this corridor closed definitively (Krijgsman et al., 2000), followed by the Guadalhorce (Pérez-Asensio, Aguirre, Schmiedl, & Civis, 2012) and the Rif corridors, creating a land bridge between Africa and Iberia (Krijgsman & Langereis, 2000), setting in motion the Messinian Salinity Crisis (MSC), from 5.96 to 5.33 Ma. The MSC ended abruptly with the formation of the Strait of Gibraltar, which remained open until the present (Duggen et al., 2003), although with varying extent. During the Pleistocene glaciations the sea level regressions shortened the distance between Africa and Iberia from the current 14 km to 4–5 km, with newly-formed islands available as stepping-stones for transcontinental colonizations of terrestrial species (Zazo, 1999).

As a consequence of this complex geological history, multiple dispersal–vicariance events took place across the Strait of Gibraltar, profoundly shaping genetic and demographical patterns of a wide number of taxa. Before the formation of the Strait of Gibraltar, the Betic-Rif Massif acted as an agent for dispersal–vicariance for taxon differentiation. Both the first closure of the Betic corridor, 10 Ma, and the MSC, 5.33 Ma, led to the dispersal of taxa in the area of the sub-Betic region and between Iberia and North Africa, respectively, whereas the re-opening of the Betic-corridor and the Strait of Gibraltar triggered the divergence of populations on both sides of the Strait (e.g. Carranza et al., 2008; Martínez-Solano, Gonçalves, Amtzen, & García-Paris, 2004; Velo-Antón et al., 2012). Transmarine colonizations long after the MSC had finished have also been

FIGURE 1 Simplified palaeogeological history of the Strait of Gibraltar area from the Middle Miocene (18 Ma) until the Messinian Salinity Crisis (adapted from Rosenbaum et al., 2002a and Paulo et al., 2008)
reported (Carranza, Arnold, & Pleguezuelos, 2006; Carranza, Arnold, Wade, & Fahd, 2004; Carranza, Harris, Arnold, Batista, & Gonzalez de la Vega, 2006; Carranza et al., 2008; Harris, Batista, Carretero, & Ferrand, 2004).

Given the intermittent land connections between Iberia and North Africa during the Miocene and varying extent of sea channels due to marine sea level oscillations during the Pleistocene, biogeographical inference across the Strait of Gibraltar has been documented as if it were a puzzle through time. The legacy of ancient biogeographical events is currently visible in distribution patterns at high taxonomic levels, generally at the genus level (Carranza et al., 2008; García-Vázquez et al., 2016; Sampaio, Harris, Perera, & Salvi, 2014), whereas more recent processes underlie the phylogeographical patterns of intraspecific groups (Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006; Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2010). While studies at the genus level are scarce, in most studies the genetic lineage distribution on both sides of the Strait is intraspecific, thus providing information for biogeographical events restricted to a relatively recent time-frame. A comprehensive vision of the biogeographical events across the Strait of Gibraltar might be enhanced by using as model a single genus, comprising taxa demonstrating both intra and interspecific genetic distributions on both sides of the Strait, such as the sand racer lizard genus Psammodromus.

Psammodromus, together with the Canary Islands endemic Gallotia, form the Gallotiinae subfamily, an ancient lineage of the Lacertidae lizard family (Arnold, Arribas, & Carranza, 2007). Six species are distributed across the Strait of Gibraltar: two North African endemic species, P. blanci (Lataste, 1880) and P. microdactylus (Boettger, 1881); three species in the Iberian Peninsula and Languedoc region, P. edwardsianus (Dugès, 1829), P. occidentalis (Fitze, Gonzalez-Jimena, San-Jose, Mauro, & Zardoya, 2012) and P. hispanicus (Fitzinger, 1826); and P. algirus (Linnaeus, 1758) distributed across the Iberian Peninsula and North Africa. Previous studies have proposed biogeographical hypotheses for the evolution of Psammodromus species. In the Iberian Peninsula, divergence due to geographical barriers and environmental differences following the closure of the Betic corridor may have led to the evolution of the three extant species (Fitze et al., 2011). Within P. algirus, mtDNA data indicate the existence of two main lineages: an eastern Iberian lineage and a western lineage including specimens from western Iberia and North Africa (Busack & Lawson, 2006; Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006; Verdú-Rico, Carranza, Salvador, Busack, & Díaz, 2010). These results could indicate that P. algirus first diverged in Iberia and later colonized North Africa. Molecular dating places the colonization of Africa by P. algirus approximately 1.9 Ma, long after the end of the MSC (Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006). The same study also puts the divergence between the African P. blanci and the Iberian clade long before the MSC, at approximately 20 Ma, thereby suggesting two transmarine colonizations to explain the distribution of Psammodromus lineages.

In this study, we generate a comprehensive molecular dataset for all the species of Psammodromus, with novel taxa and nuclear markers compared to previous studies. We apply both concatenation and coalescent species tree approaches, and estimate divergence times of the main lineages and their ancestral geographical distribution. Our main aim is to frame the temporal and spatial patterns of the evolutionary history of Psammodromus within the biogeographical dynamics of the Strait of Gibraltar in order to contribute to the understanding of the faunal exchange across the Pillars of Hercules.

2 | MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 | Sampling

Twenty-seven Psammodromus specimens were employed in the phylogenetic analyses, including all six species currently described (Figure 2). Lizards were captured and handled under permit of relevant authorities. Six samples of Gallotia caesaris caesaris, G. c. gomerae and G. atlantica were used as outgroups. Information regarding the sample codes and sampling localities is given in Table 1.

2.2 | DNA extraction, amplification and sequencing

Genomic DNA was extracted from alcohol-preserved tail muscle following standard high-salt protocols (Sambrook, Fritsch, & Maniatis, 1989). We amplified fragments of three mitochondrial (mtDNA) genes, NADH Dehydrogenase 4 plus flanking tRNAs (nd4), ribosomal 12S rRNA gene (12S) and cytochrome b (cytb), and of three nuclear (nucDNA) genes, Acetylcholinergic Receptor M4 (acm4), Melanocortin 1 Receptor (mc1r) and Proopiomelanocortin (pomc). These markers have been shown to be highly variable in lacertid lizards (e.g. Mendes, Harris, Carranza, & Salvi, 2016; Salvi, Schembri, Sciberras, & Harris, 2014). Primers and conditions of polymerase chain reactions (PCR) are reported in Table S1.

2.3 | Phylogenetic inference

Nucleotide sequences were aligned using the MUSCLE algorithm (Edgar, 2004) in GENEIOUS (Biomatters Ltd.). Haplotype reconstruction for nuclear markers was performed in PHASE 2.1 (Stephens, Smith, & Donnelly, 2001). PHASE was run three times to assure consistency of results, with a phase probability threshold of 0.7. The occurrence of recombination events in nucDNA was evaluated using the Pairwise Homoplasy Index (phi) test implemented in SPLITSTREE4 4.13.1 (Huson & Bryant, 2006).

Phylogenetic relationships among the Psammodromus species were inferred by maximum likelihood (ML), Bayesian inference (BI) and the Bayesian species tree approach based on the multi-species coalescent model (Heled & Drummond, 2010). For the ML and BI analyses, the mitochondrial and (unphased) nuclear DNA sequence data (mt-nucDNA) were concatenated. The ML analyses were performed in RAxML 7.4.2 (Stamatakis, 2006). ML searches included 10 random addition replicates and 1,000 nonparametric bootstrap replicates, applying the general time-reversible models with a gamma model of rate heterogeneity (GTRGAMMA) for each of the six gene
Bayesian analyses were performed in BEAST 1.8.0 (Drummond, Suchard, Xie, & Rambaut, 2012) The best model of nucleotide substitution for each gene was assessed in MODELTEST 2.1.7 (Posada, 2008) under the Bayesian information criterion (Table S2). Models and prior specifications applied in BEAUTI were as follows (otherwise by default): tree model of all gene partitions linked, nucleotide substitution and clock models unlinked; model of nucleotide substitution for 12S set as HKY, because preliminary runs with the GTR model presented low effective sample size (ESS) values. A relaxed uncorrelated lognormal clock was set for all genes, Yule process of speciation as tree prior, random starting tree, alpha uniform (0, 10), ucl.mean uniform and operator kappa (2.0). BEAST was run three times, with 50 million generations, sampling every 5,000 generations. The use of the Yule process of speciation prior requires only one sequence per species, whereas our concatenated dataset included multiple samples per species. Therefore, to inspect the sensitivity of our estimates to the choice of tree prior, we confirmed that identical results were obtained in an additional run applying the same settings as above but using only one representative sequence for each species (Figure S1).

The species tree was inferred using the *BEAST extension of the BEAST software. We used the mtDNA sequences and the phased alignments of the nuclear genes and their relative models of
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Map code</th>
<th>Locality</th>
<th>Geographic coordinates</th>
<th>GenBank accession number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>P. microdactylus</em></td>
<td>25232</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Azilal, Morocco</td>
<td>31.92 N, –6.66 E</td>
<td>MF684874 MF684919 MF684964 MF684898 MF684938 MF684987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. microdactylus</em></td>
<td>25250</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Azilal, Morocco</td>
<td>31.92 N, –6.66 E</td>
<td>MF684875 MF684920 MF684965 MF684899 MF684939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. microdactylus</em></td>
<td>25384</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ait Khalifa, Sefrou, Morocco</td>
<td>33.69 N, –4.84 E</td>
<td>MF684876 MF684921 MF684966 MF684940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. blanci</em></td>
<td>11219</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Belezma National Park, Algeria</td>
<td>35.58 N, 6.08 E</td>
<td>MF684877 MF684922 MF684967 MF684941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. blanci</em></td>
<td>11220</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Belezma National Park, Algeria</td>
<td>35.58 N, 6.08 E</td>
<td>MF684878 MF684923 MF684968 MF684942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. blanci</em></td>
<td>T31-47a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Bou Chebka, Tunisia</td>
<td>35.12 N, 8.49 E</td>
<td>MF684879 MF684924 MF684969 MF684900 MF684943 MF684988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. occidentalis</em></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Castelo de Vide, Portugal</td>
<td>39.43 N, –7.58 E</td>
<td>MF684901 MF684944 MF684989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. occidentalis</em></td>
<td>4213</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Miranda do Douro, Portugal</td>
<td>41.40 N, –6.37 E</td>
<td>MF684902 MF684945</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. occidentalis</em></td>
<td>25453</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Compenal del Arroyo, Spain</td>
<td>40.43 N, –4.18 E</td>
<td>MF684881 MF684971 MF684903 MF684946 MF684990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. occidentalis</em></td>
<td>25454</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Doñana National Park, Spain</td>
<td>37.01 N, –6.57 E</td>
<td>MF684882 MF684926 MF684972 MF684904 MF684947 MF684991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. edwarsianus</em></td>
<td>1869</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>El Prat de Llobregat, Spain</td>
<td>41.29 N, 2.10 E</td>
<td>MF684905 MF684948 MF684992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. edwarsianus</em></td>
<td>14359</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>La Mata y Torrevieja Natural Park, Spain</td>
<td>38.02 N, –0.70 E</td>
<td>MF684883 MF684973 MF684906 MF684949 MF684993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. hispanicus</em></td>
<td>1723</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>La Huerta, Spain</td>
<td>38.36 N, –2.51 E</td>
<td>KX080629 KX081066 KX080992 KX080782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. hispanicus</em></td>
<td>1784</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>La Huerta, Spain</td>
<td>38.34 N, –2.61 E</td>
<td>MF684884 MF684974 MF684907 MF684950 MF684994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. hispanicus</em></td>
<td>1850</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Segura de la Sierra, Spain</td>
<td>38.29 N, –2.59 E</td>
<td>KX080630 KX081067 KX080993 KX080783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. hispanicus</em></td>
<td>1856</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Cortijos de Tortas, Spain</td>
<td>38.54 N, –2.42 E</td>
<td>MF684885 MF684975 MF684951 MF684995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>1291</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Embalse de Camarillas, Spain</td>
<td>38.34 N, –1.65 E</td>
<td>MF684886 MF684976 MF684952 MF684996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>2347</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Imi n'Ifrí, Morocco</td>
<td>31.72 N, –6.97 E</td>
<td>KX080631 KX081068 KX080784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>2356</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Azrou, Morocco</td>
<td>33.54 N, –5.32 E</td>
<td>KX080632 KX081069 KX080994 KX080785 MF684997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>3784</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Tabarka, Tunisia</td>
<td>36.95 N, 8.76 E</td>
<td>MF684887 MF684927 MF684977 MF684908 MF684953 MF684998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>3854</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Múrcia, Spain</td>
<td>37.93 N, –1.10 E</td>
<td>MF684888 MF684928 MF684978 MF684909 MF684954 MF684999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>4235</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Taza, Morocco</td>
<td>34.13 N, –4.03 E</td>
<td>MF684889 MF684929 MF684979 MF684910 MF684955 MF685000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>16794</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>São Lourenço, Portugal</td>
<td>41.29 N, –7.37 E</td>
<td>MF684890 MF684930 MF684980 MF684911 MF684956 MF685001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>21567</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Matalascañas, Spain</td>
<td>37.00 N, –6.56 E</td>
<td>MF684891 MF684931 MF684981 MF684912 MF684957 MF685002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>23902</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Jbel Síroua, Morocco</td>
<td>30.74 N, –7.61 E</td>
<td>MF684892 MF684932 MF684982 MF684913 MF684958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P. algirus</em></td>
<td>24987</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Gouveia, Portugal</td>
<td>40.51 N, –7.53 E</td>
<td>MF684893 MF684933 MF684914 MF684959 MF685003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Galloporia atlantica</em></td>
<td>1244</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>Lanzarote, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>29.05 N, –13.56 E</td>
<td>KX080625 KX081062 KX080988 KX080778 MF685004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Continues)
TABLE 1 (Continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Map code</th>
<th>Locality</th>
<th>Geographic coordinates</th>
<th>GenBank accession number</th>
<th>Map coordinates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gallotia atlantica</td>
<td>1341</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>Lanzarote, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>28.95 N, – 13.77 E</td>
<td>KKX080626</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallotia caesaris gomerae</td>
<td>19355</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>La Gomera, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>28.12 N, – 17.16 E</td>
<td>MF684894, MF684934, MF684983, MF684915, MF684960, MF685006</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallotia caesaris gomerae</td>
<td>19375</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>La Gomera, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>28.10 N, – 17.13 E</td>
<td>MF684895, MF684935, MF684984, MF684916, MF684961, MF685007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallotia caesaris caesaris</td>
<td>19413</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>El Hierro, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>27.81 N, – 17.91 E</td>
<td>MF684896, MF684936, MF684985, MF684917, MF684962, MF685008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallotia caesaris caesaris</td>
<td>19470</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>El Hierro, Canary Islands, Spain</td>
<td>27.73 N, – 18.12 E</td>
<td>MF684897, MF684937, MF684986, MF684918, MF684963, MF685009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

nucleotide evolution (Table S2). The settings applied in *BEAST for the species tree reconstruction were similar to the concatenated BEAST analyses, except the tree model of the mitochondrial genes 12S, cyt b and nd4 was linked. *BEAST was run three times with 400 million generations, sampling every 40,000 generations.

We used Tracer 1.6 to check all BEAST runs for convergence (burn-in = 10%) and that all ESS parameters were higher than 200. All runs were combined with LOGCOMBINER and TREEANNOTATOR was used to calculate the maximum clade credibility (MCC) tree summarizing the posterior distribution of tree topologies and branch lengths. Trees were visualized in FigTree 1.4 (available at http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/figtree/). BEAST analyses were performed on the CIPRES Science Gateway 3.3 (Miller, Pfefifer, & Schwartz, 2010).

2.4 | Molecular dating

In order to infer the time of cladogenetic events within Gallotinae we used the estimated rates of evolution of 12S and cyt b of lacertid lizards (Carranza & Arnold, 2012). We implemented a normal distribution prior for the ucl.mean parameters of the 12S (mean: 0.00553, stdev: 0.00128) and cyt b (mean: 0.0164, stdev: 0.00317) gene fragments in *BEAST. To infer divergence time within species we also applied the same priors in BEAST on the concatenated mt-nucDNA dataset (all gene partitions linked).

We cross-validated the substitution rates used by performing (1) an estimate of 12S and cyt b rates based on the procedure and the dataset of Carranza and Arnold (2012) but excluding the MSC vicariance between Podarcis species as calibration point (since the use of the MSC in molecular clock calibrations is under debate; see Hewitt, 2011 and also the Discussion section), and (2) a time tree estimate applying on our dataset the priors on Gallotia nodes used by Carranza and Arnold (2012): a uniform prior from 14.5 to 0 Ma for the root of Gallotia and a prior constraining the split between Gallotia c. caesaris and Gallotia g. gomerae soon after the emergence of the El Hierro Island 1.12 Ma (Normal prior: mean = 1, SD = 0.1, upper limit truncated to 1.12). Rates and time estimates resulting from all molecular dating analyses were almost identical (Figure 3 and Figure S2). Additionally, the 12S rate used in this study is in agreement with the 12S rate estimated in other lacertid species (Salvi, Pinho, & Harris, 2017).

2.5 | Ancestral area reconstruction

Biogeographical reconstructions were performed in RASP 3.0 (Yu, Harris, Blair, & He, 2015) using the statistical dispersal–vicariance analysis (S-DIVA) (Yu, Harris, & He, 2010), dispersal-extinction cladogenesis (DEC) (Ree & Smith, 2008) and Bayesian binary MCMC (BBM) (Yu, Harris, & Xingjin, 2011) methods. We used all the post-burnin trees and the MCC tree resultant from the concatenated BEAST run as input. To evaluate the effect of changing the number of areas in the reconstruction of the ancestral geographical distribution, we performed two sets of analyses: with two areas: North Africa (A) and Iberian Peninsula (B) (Figure 3), and with three areas: North Africa (A), Western Iberia (B) and Eastern Iberia (C) (Figure S3).

S-DIVA was conducted using 1,000 trees randomly sampled from the input trees. DEC analyses were run either with the default connectivity value (equal to 1.0) between ancestral ranges along the time trees or implementing the known palaeogeographical model of the Strait of Gibraltar (detailed settings in Appendix S1). Results were identical between the simple and the stratified models (likely because of the low number of cladogenetic events in each time slice, see Ree & Sanmartin, 2009), so only results from the default connectivity model are provided here. BBM analyses were run with the Jukes-Cantor model, site variation set to equal and maximum number of areas set to two and three, respectively. We performed two
### FIGURE 3

(a) Bayesian tree depicting the phylogenetic relationships between *Psammodromus* lizards based on concatenated mitochondrial (12S, cytB, nd4) and nuclear (acm4, mc1r, pomc) DNA sequence. Numbers beside species names indicate specimen codes (Table 1) and numbers between brackets indicate locality codes as shown in Figure 2 and (b). Values above nodes represent Bayesian posterior probabilities (BPP) $\geq 0.9$ (left) and maximum likelihood bootstrap (BS) values $\geq 70$ (right). Node support for intra-specific clades is represented by black circles: BPP $\geq 0.98$ (upper half) and BS $\geq 95$ (bottom half); grey circles: $0.9 \leq$ BPP $< 0.98$ (up) and $70 \leq$ BS $< 95$ (bottom) and empty circles for nodes with lower support. Values below nodes represent the estimated age of the node with associated 95% highest posterior density interval (in parentheses) according to molecular dating analyses. Coloured squares represent the geographic origin of each tip sample in either Iberia or Africa according to the inset (b). Coloured pie charts in correspondence of nodes (which are named from G to M) represent results from ancestral range reconstructions based on S-DIVA (top), DEC (middle) and BBM (bottom) methods. Colour legend of ancestral areas represented in pie charts is at the top left. (b) Map of the study area with sampling localities and the areas used for ancestral range reconstruction: (A) Africa (green) and (B) Iberia (blue).
Results

3.1 Molecular data, *Psammodromus* phylogeny and divergence time

A total of 159 new sequences were obtained (GenBank accession numbers in Table 1). In order to concatenate only sequences from the same individual we avoided including published sequences from GenBank. The length of the gene fragments and the number of polymorphic sites are reported in Table S2. The translation of these genes into amino acid sequences did not contain stop codons. The phi test did not find statistically significant evidence for recombination in the nuclear gene fragments (\( p > .05 \)).

Phylogenetic relationships between *Psammodromus* species recovered by species tree and concatenated dataset were identical (Figures 3a & 4). Maximum likelihood and BI analyses based on the concatenated dataset resulted in identical relationships between species with overall high bootstrap (BS) and Bayesian posterior probabilities (BPP) values (Figure 3a). The divergence time estimates were similar between concatenated (Figure 3a) and species trees (Figure 4), therefore from here on we will refer only to time estimates of the concatenated tree (Figure 3a). The genera Gallotia and *Psammodromus* are reciprocally monophyletic with divergence between them estimated at 15 Ma (95% highest posterior densities interval (95% HPD): 10.3–20.67). All *Psammodromus* species are monophyletic (Figures 3a & 4; BPP \( \geq 0.9 \), BS \( \geq 70 \)). *Psammodromus algirus* was the first species to diverge within the *Psammodromus* clade (Figures 3a & 4; BPP = 1, BS = 100), approximately 13 Ma (95% HPD: 8.79–17.5), and includes three lineages: the Eastern Iberia lineage,
which diverged circa 2.5 Ma (95% HPD: 1.57–3.33) from the Western Iberia lineage and the North African lineage. The latter two diverged about 1.4 Ma (95%HPD: 0.91–2.0) (Figures 2 & 3). The North African endemic *P. blanci* and *P. microactylus* are sister species (Figures 3a & 4; BPP = 1, BS = 100) and diverged from the Iberian clade (*P. occidentalis*, *P. hispanicus* and *P. edwarsianus*) approximately 10 Ma (95% HPD: 7.08–14.05) and between each other 6 Ma (95% HPD: 4.33–8.78) (Figures 3a & 4). *Psammodromus blanci* shows a deep differentiation between two lineages in the Aurès Mountains, estimated at 3.5 Ma (95% HPD: 2.26–4.98), (Figures 2 & 3a). *Psammodromus microactylus* presents a comparatively lower, but still notable, differentiation between the two populations sampled (Figures 2 & 3a). Diversification within the Iberian clade started approximately 4.7 Ma (95% HPD: 3.12–6.44) with the split of *P. occidentalis* followed by the split between the sister species *P. hispanicus* and *P. edwarsianus* at 3.5 Ma (95% HPD: 2.17–4.9) (Figures 3a & 4).

### 3.2 | Ancestral area reconstruction

All biogeographical analyses, based on either two areas (Africa and Iberia) or three areas (Africa, Western Iberia and Eastern Iberia), inferred the same biogeographical scenario for the nodes K, I and J: the ancestor of the species *P. blanci* and *P. microactylus* has an African origin (node K), and the ancestors of *P. occidentalis*, *P. hispanicus* and *P. edwarsianus* (nodes I and J) have an Iberian origin (Figure S3). The ancestral areas inferred for the basal nodes within the genus (G and H) are either in Iberia (BBM: 95% in G, 77% in H; S-DIVA: 50% in G) or shared by Iberia and Africa (S-DIVA: 50% in G, 100% in H) in the two areas analyses (Figure 3). A similar inference is presented in node M for the most recent speciation nodes (Sanmartí et al., 2007), so speciation following early dispersal events in the phylogeny imply wide ancestral ranges at deep nodes. Such a pattern has been observed before (Liu et al., 2016; Perea, Cobo-Simon, & Doadrio, 2016) and is likely due to the underlying assumptions of these methods (Buerki et al., 2011). Both DIVA and DEC models are based on the assumption of “vicariance-mediated allopatry”, in which dispersal is modelled as wide ancestral range divided by vicariance (or also peripheral isolate speciation in DEC) at speciation nodes (Sanmartin, 2007), so speciation following early dispersal events in the phylogeny imply wide ancestral ranges at deep nodes (see e.g. node H in Figure 3). Additionally, in DEC analyses widespread terminals subtended by a long branch, such as *P. algirus* in our case, may have the effect of increasing the uncertainty at deeper nodes (Buerki et al., 2011; Ree, Moore, Webb, & Donoghue, 2005).

### 4 | DISCUSSION

The use of a multilocus dataset including all species allowed estimation of a fully resolved phylogeny of the genus *Psammodromus*. Relationships between species received high statistical support (Figures 3a & 4) and are congruent with relationships previously inferred using mostly mtDNA data from incomplete taxon sets (Busack, Salvador, & Lawson, 2006; Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006; Fitze et al., 2011, 2012; Verdu-Rico et al., 2010). *Psammodromus algirus* represents an early branch within the genus and is sister to two clades endemic to Africa and Iberia, respectively. In the Iberian clade, the species *P. occidentalis* is sister to *P. hispanicus* and *P. edwarsianus*. Unlike previous studies, our phylogeny includes *P. microactylus* which is sister to the other African species *P. blanci*. Both species of this African clade show two deeply divergent lineages separated by a relatively small geographical distance (Figures 2 & 3).

Here we integrate the information of the main cladogenetic events within *Psammodromus*, and their estimated time and ancestral geographical distribution, within the context of the palaeogeographical evolution of the Strait of Gibraltar to trace the biogeographical history of *Psammodromus* across North Africa and Western Europe. The biogeographical inference from the Bayesian binary MCMC (BBM) is in agreement with the fossil and palaeogeographical evidence and with the timing and pattern of cladogenetic events inferred for *Psammodromus* from molecular data (Figures 1 & 3). Biogeographical inferences obtained with the S-DIVA and DEC methods show higher uncertainty and wider ancestral ranges at deep nodes. Such a pattern has been observed before (Liu et al., 2016; Perea, Cobo-Simon, & Doadrio, 2016) and is likely due to the underlying assumptions of these methods (Buerki et al., 2011). Both DIVA and DEC models are based on the assumption of “vicariance-mediated allopatry”; in which dispersal is modelled as wide ancestral range divided by vicariance (or also peripheral isolate speciation in DEC) at speciation nodes (Sanmartin, 2007), so speciation following early dispersal events in the phylogeny imply wide ancestral ranges at deep nodes (see e.g. node H in Figure 3). Additionally, in DEC analyses widespread terminals subtended by a long branch, such as *P. algirus* in our case, may have the effect of increasing the uncertainty at deeper nodes (Buerki et al., 2011; Ree, Moore, Webb, & Donoghue, 2005).

### 4.1 | Historical biogeography of *Psammodromus*

The origin of the genus *Psammodromus* was likely in Western Europe according to previous knowledge. The European origin of lacertids, and of the Gallotiinae in particular, is supported by (1) fossil evidence (Augé, 2005; Černanský, Klembara, & Smith, 2016; Figure S4, Table S3), (2) the mainly European distribution of the first genera to branch off in the lacertid phylogeny (Arnold et al., 2007) and (3) a high species diversity in Europe compared to Africa (Arnold et al., 2007; Pavilcëv & Mayer, 2009).

The origin of the *Psammodromus* radiation is estimated to have started in the Middle Miocene (Fitze et al., 2011; present study) or even in the Early Miocene (Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006). At that time, the westernmost Mediterranean was characterized by intense geological activity, with the southward drift of the Betic-Rif block across the Gibraltar region. The exact position of the Betic-Rif after...
the breaking of the Hercynian belt until it reached its final position in the Strait of Gibraltar remains debatable. While some authors advocate that the Betic-Rif was attached to Iberia until a marine transgression separated them, 16–14 Ma (Lonergan & White, 1997), others suggest that, separated from Iberia, it formed a continuous block with the Balearic Islands and Kabyles until 15 Ma (Rosenbaum, Lister, & Duboz, 2002b; Rosenbaum et al., 2002a) or with the Balearic Islands alone, until 10 Ma (Fontboté et al., 1990). Given the absence of remains referable to Psammodromus within the well-studied fossil record of the Balearic Islands (Bailon, Boistel, Bover, & Alcover, 2014; Pinya & Carretero, 2011 and references therein) it is likely that the genus would have arrived to Africa by dispersal from the palaeo-Iberia through the Betic-Rif, after the detachment of the latter from the other blocks. The alternative hypotheses that the ancestor of P. blanci and P. microdactylus would have reached Africa by vicariance following the detachment of either the Hercynian belt (Betic-Rif+Balearics+Kabyles+Corsica-Sardinia+Calabria) from Iberia (30 Ma) or the Betic-Rif block from the other Hercynian blocks (16–14 Ma) is less plausible not only for the lack of Psammodromus fossils in these blocks but also considering the estimated time of divergence between the Iberian and the African clades, although the latter cannot be definitively rejected. According to our estimates, the cladogenetic event that gave rise to the ancestor of P. blanci and P. microdactylus occurred during the Middle to Late Miocene, or even earlier in the Early to Middle Miocene (Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006). Assuming no undocumented extinctions, this time estimate provides an approximate upper limit for the colonization of Africa. Whether the cladogenesis between the ancestors of the Iberian clade (P. occidentalis, P. edwarsianus and P. hispanicus) and of the African clade (P. blanci and P. microdactylus) was due to a dispersal event between these areas, or if the divergence of the ancestor of the African clade slightly predated its dispersal, the colonization of Africa took place during a period when the Betic-Rif massif was fragmented and separated from mainland by sea corridors to the north and south (Figure 1b). The Northern Betic sea corridor closed approximately 10 Ma, originating a temporary land bridge between Iberian and the sub-Betic massif that disappeared when this sea corridor re-opened 9–8 Ma. Therefore, the arrival into North Africa of the ancestor of P. blanci and P. microdactylus was likely achieved through stepping stones across the Betic-Rif (Figure 5a).

The ancestor of P. blanci and P. microdactylus underwent considerable diversification after it reached North Africa. The divergence between the two species is dated at the end of the Miocene (Figure 5a). Climatic conditions, shifting towards aridity in North Africa during the Miocene and the Pliocene, may have played a role in their divergence, as has been described for other reptile species during this period (Amer & Kumazawa, 2005; Gonçalves et al., 2012). We identified two main evolutionary lineages within each species. In P. blanci, the divergence between the two lineages is as deep as between the species P. hispanicus and P. edwarsianus (3.5 Ma). Such a level of divergence between two sampling localities closely located in the Eastern Maghreb (Figure 2) is suggestive of undescribed diversity, especially considering that the range of P. blanci extends to Eastern Morocco. The high genetic differentiation within P. microdactylus and its fragmented distribution are indicative of a relictual pattern possibly resultant of widespread extinction mediated by climatic or ecological changes. Additional studies are necessary to fully understand the diversity

**FIGURE 5** Dispersal–vicariance events in Psammodromus in Iberia and North Africa before (a) and after (b) the end of the Messinian salinity crisis, 5.33 Ma. Dark red represents the direction, age and taxa in the dispersal events. Dashed yellow represent age and vicariance events in Africa and Iberia.
and the evolutionary history of these species, with a possible novel taxonomical assessment.

A major role for vicariance processes behind the diversification of the Iberian clade has been previously suggested (Fitze et al., 2011) and is supported by our results. Under this biogeographical scenario, the final closure of the Betic corridor (7.6–7.8 Ma) caused the formation of the Guadalquivir basin, which acted as a vicariant factor driving the divergence between P. occidentalis and the remaining Iberian species following an East-West differentiation (Figure 5). This geographical pattern has been described for multiple Iberian species (e.g. Harris, Carranza, Arnold, Pinho, & Ferrand, 2002; Harris & Sá-Sousa, 2002; Martínez-Solano et al., 2004). Later, during the MSC, geological and climatic changes associated with the uplift of the Spanish Central System and the re-configuration of the main river drainage in Iberia would have ultimately led to the differentiation between P. edwardsianus and P. hispanicus (Fitze et al., 2011). The main difference between our results and those from Fitze et al. (2011) is that the inferred time is more recent in our study. This may be attributed to the use of different molecular data and rates of evolution. However, the uncertainty of such estimates overlap for the majority of the associated confidence intervals, while supporting the same pattern of evolution of these three species.

Finally, the pattern of diversification in the most widespread species of the genus, P. algerius, shows some striking parallels with the wall lizard Podarcis vaucheri (Kaliontzopoulou, Pinho, Harris, & Carretero, 2011). The fact that P. algerius, like Podarcis vaucheri, has an African lineage nested within two paraphyletic Iberian lineages is an indication that both species diverged in Iberia and then reached North Africa. According to our dated phylogeny, the divergence of the African lineage of P. algerius took place approximately 1.4 Ma, and therefore this species colonized North Africa through transmarine dispersal across the Strait of Gibraltar (Figure 5b). This colonization was likely associated with a sea level low stand during a glacial stage, when the distance between Iberia and North Africa was reduced. Such a scenario has been described by Carranza, Harris, et al. (2006) and is concordant with our ancestral area reconstructions (Figure 3, nodes L and M). During the last five million years, several species have independently crossed in both directions the Strait of Gibraltar in different occasions after its opening (Carranza et al., 2004; Carranza, Arnold, et al. 2006; Carranza, Harris, et al., 2006; Carranza et al., 2008 Gaubert et al., 2011; Harris, Batista, Lymberakis, & Carretero, 2004; Harris, Batista, Carretero, et al., 2004).

The historical biogeography of Psammodromus indicates that the Strait of Gibraltar has been a permeable biogeographical barrier for these lizards since their early evolution during the Middle Miocene. While the MSC (5.9–5.33 Ma) is often seen as a major period for biotic exchanges between Africa and Europe, due to their wide land connection, this study shows that dispersal over narrow sea channels before and after the MSC (Figure 5) possibly had a major role in shaping the biogeographical patterns of Psammodromus across the Pillars of Hercules.

4.2 Concluding remarks on biotic exchange between Western Europe and North Africa

In this study, our dated phylogeny and different ancestral area reconstructions provided a robust statistical framework for biogeographical inference, while the well-known geological history of this region provided an independent temporal (and spatial) framework for such an inference. This may compensate the intrinsic uncertainty associated with time estimates based on molecular clocks (Pulquérió & Nichols, 2007) and the paucity of fossil data associated to the internal nodes of our phylogeny.

The historical biogeography of Psammodromus seems to have been predominantly a history of dispersals across the Strait of Gibraltar. Both interspecific and intraspecific diversification in this genus has been associated with dispersal from Iberia to North Africa through transmarine colonizations on different occasions (Figure 5). On the other hand, vicariance most likely played a role in the diversification of lineages within Iberia and North Africa (Figure 5), but more phylogeographical data, hopefully combined with fossil information, are needed to develop a stronger understanding of diversification patterns of the African taxa.

The cladogenetic events between Iberian and African lineages within Psammodromus are dated well before or long after the vicariant event at the end of the MSC (5.33 Ma). Indeed, none of the Bayesian analyses of divergence time (BEAST or *BEAST), which incorporated a wide range of molecular rates, provided 95% posterior intervals on these nodes that overlapped with the MSC. Therefore, in Psammodromus, range evolution and cladogenesis are clearly associated to oversese dispersals from Iberia toward Africa rather than with the vicariance at the end of the MSC. This pattern is not restricted to Psammodromus and is well documented in recent literature. Indeed, for many terrestrial organisms such as worm lizards and salamanders the high divergence of populations across the Strait of Gibraltar is associated to early crossing of the Strait since the Middle Miocene, likely through the Betic-Rif stepping stones, whereas in many other—such as shrews, larks, snakes, chameleons, skinks, salamanders, frogs and mongooses—shallow divergence underlie dispersal during the Late Pleistocene, possibly in correspondence of sea level low stand in glacial maxima (reviewed in Hewitt, 2011; see also Gaubert et al., 2011; Santos, Rato, Carranza, Carretero, & Pleguezuelos, 2012). This emerging body of evidence has far reaching implications for molecular biogeography studies beyond the Strait of Gibraltar. Indeed, to date numerous studies have extensively assumed the end of the MSC as the main vicariant cause of species divergence across the Strait and many sea channels across the Mediterranean (e.g. Brown et al., 2008; Chueca, Gómez-Molina, Forés, & Madeira, 2017; Prüser & Mossakowski, 1998) and used this timing point in phylogenies to calibrate rates of molecular divergence and speciation. However, this and other recent studies (references listed in Hewitt, 2011) demonstrate that the assumption of such a “vicariance-mediated allopatry” model may not be justified in many cases and a “dispersal-mediated allopatry” model of speciation fits most of the available data significantly better. Since the latter model implies either much older or more recent divergence compared with the
vicariance model used so far, this realization warrant a re-assessment of many available molecular rates inferred around the MSC paradigm.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank CIBIO and IBE (CSIC/UPF) colleagues for their help during samples collection. Lizards were captured and handled under permit of the Haut Commissariat aux Eaux et Forêts of Morocco (HCEF/LCD/ DLCDPN/DPRN/DDF No14/2010); the Institute for the Conservation of Nature and Forest—ICNF, Portugal (459/2015/CAPT and 532/ 2015/CAPT). J.M. and D.J.H. are supported by the Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia (FCT, Portugal); J.M., doctoral grant SFRH/BD/ 81528/2011; D.J.H. IF contract 01627/2014. S.C. is supported by Grant CGL2015-70390 from the Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad, Spain (co-funded by Fondos FEDER – EU). D.S. is currently supported by the program “Rita Levi Montalcini” for the recruitment of young researchers at the University of L’Aquila.

DATA ACCESSIBILITY

All sequences generated for this study are deposited in GenBank with accession numbers listed in the results section (see Table 1).

ORCID

Salvador Carranza — http://orcid.org/0000-0002-5378-3008
Daniele Salvi — http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3804-2690

REFERENCES


BIOSKETCH

Joana Mendes is a PhD student at CIBIO (Portugal). This work is part of her dissertation, which main focus is the application of phylogenetic methods to understand the evolutionary history of squamate taxa in the Palearctic. The authors have a long-term collaboration history in phyleography and phylogenetics of reptiles and amphibians from the Mediterranean basin.

Author contributions: D.J.H and D.S. conceived the ideas; J.M., D.J.H, S.C. and D.S. collected the specimens; J.M. generated the data; J.M. and D.S analysed the data; J.M. and D.S. led the writing, which was revised by all authors.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional Supporting Information may be found online in the supporting information tab for this article.

How to cite this article: Mendes J, Harris DJ, Carranza S, Salvi D. Biogeographical crossroad across the Pillars of Hercules: Evolutionary history of Psammodromus lizards in space and time. J Biogeogr. 2017;00:1–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/jbi.13100